

2011SYE090 – 19-21 Gerrale Street, Cronulla
DA11/0763

ASSESSMENT REPORT APPENDICES

Appendix	A	Summary of Submissions
	B	Minutes from Architectural Review Advisory Panel Meeting of 1 September, 2011 and 5 October, 2011

DA11/0763 – 19-21 Gerrale Street, Cronulla (2011SYE090)
Summary of Submissions Received

Contact Details	Date of Submission Letter/s	Applicant/ Objector/ Supporter
15 Queanbeyan Avenue, Miranda	2/09/2011	Supporter
Bang on Cronulla, Shop 5/ 17 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	23/09/2011	Supporter
23 Bottle Forest Road, Heathcote	7/09/2011	Supporter
266 Woollooware Road, Cronulla	20/09/2011	Supporter
PO Box 2764, Taren Point	15/09/2011	Supporter
10 Kurramatta Place, Cronulla	13/09/2011	Supporter
24 Atchison Street, Flinders	17/09/2011	Supporter
	5/09/2011	Supporter
25 Woodward Avenue, Caringbah	13/09/2011	Supporter
15/7-9 Tonkin Street, Cronulla	22/09/2011	Supporter
	2/09/2011	Supporter
4/67 Denman Avenue, Woollooware	14/09/2011	Supporter
105 Bath Road, Kirrawee	1/09/2011	Supporter
8 Aldgate Street, Sutherland	9/09/2011	Supporter
24 Illawong Avenue, Caringbah	18/09/2011	Supporter
52 Brushwood Drive, Alfords Point	6/09/2011	Supporter
9 Philip Street, Cronulla	13/09/2011	Supporter
	4/09/2011	Supporter
232 Ellesmere Road, Gymea Bay	16/09/2011	Supporter
PO Box 1157, Cronulla	31/08/2011	Supporter
ron@cronullafurniture.com.au	23/09/2011	Supporter
Char Bella Boutique, Shop 4/ 17 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	23/09/2011	Supporter
5/10-12 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	25/8/11 31/08/2011	Supporter
kimcoulter@bigpond.com.au	5/09/2011	Supporter
michaelcripps@iinet.net.au	8/09/2011	Supporter
7 Clydesdale Close, Murrumbateman	15/09/2011	Supporter

DA11/0763 – 19-21 Gerrale Street, Cronulla (2011SYE090)
Summary of Submissions Received

Contact Details	Date of Submission Letter/s	Applicant/ Objector/ Supporter
De Frenza Hair Salon, 3/30 Kingsway, Cronulla	23/09/2011	Supporter
	5/09/2011	Supporter
15 Matthew Flinders Place, Burraneer	22/09/2011	Supporter
55 Taloombi Street, Cronulla	6/09/2011	Supporter
124 Bellingara Rd, Miranda NSW 2228	29/09/2011	Supporter
Beach & Bay Realty Pty Ltd, Suite 1/ 64 Croydon Street, Cronulla	13/09/2011	Supporter
Beach & Bay Realty Pty Ltd, Suite 1/ 64 Croydon Street, Cronulla	20/09/2011	Supporter
Feros Group of Hotels, 105 Parraweena Road, Taren Point	26/09/2011	Supporter
7 Via Mare, Cronulla	7/09/2011	Supporter
105 Parraweena Road, Taren Point	26/09/2011	Supporter
	18/09/2011	Supporter
63 Taloombi Street, Cronulla	30/08/2011	Supporter
63 Taloombi Street, Cronulla	31/08/2011	Supporter
dgatt@tpg.com.au	17/09/2011	Supporter
Geelan, PO Box CP 449, Condell Park 2200	8/09/2011	Supporter
32 Buchanan Svenue, Bonnet Bay	14/09/2011	Supporter
giardini, U 47/ 65-75 Captain Cook Drive, Caringbah	6/09/2011	Supporter
48 Beauford avenue, Caringbah South	7/09/2011	Supporter
In Bud Florist, 17 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	23/09/2011	Supporter
U 704/ 7-11 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	5/09/2011	Supporter
U 704/ 7-11 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	25/08/2011	Supporter
79-81 Nicholson Parade, Cronulla	29/08/2011	Supporter
55 Australia Road, Barden Ridge	8/09/2011	Supporter
232 Ellesmere Road, GyMEA Bay	16/09/2011	Supporter
1/1 Glandore Street, Woolooware 2230	26/09/2011	Supporter
Maxim Louvres, PO Box 2951, Taren Point	9/09/2011	Supporter

DA11/0763 – 19-21 Gerrale Street, Cronulla (2011SYE090)
Summary of Submissions Received

Contact Details	Date of Submission Letter/s	Applicant/ Objector/ Supporter
43 Caronia Avenue, Cronulla	8/09/2011	Supporter
182 Nicholson Parade, Cronulla	7/09/2011	Supporter
37 Venetia Street, Sylvania	15/09/2011	Supporter
Gibson Howlin Lawyers, PO Box 61, Cronulla	19/09/2011	Supporter
Indossa Hairdresser Saloon, 2/14 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	23/09/2011	Supporter
Indossa Hairdresser Saloon, 2/14 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	23/09/2011	Supporter
105 Parraweena Road, Taren Point	2/09/2011	Supporter
17 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	7/09/2011	Supporter
Ham Café, 17 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	23/09/2011	Supporter
Ham Café, 17 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	23/09/2011	Supporter
3/14 Gerrale Street, Cronulla 2230	23/09/2011	Supporter
Frangipani Ice Creams, 117 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	23/09/2011	Supporter
2/21-25 Wyanbah Road, Cronulla	31/08/2011	Supporter
6/117 Kingsway, Caringbah	21/09/2011	Supporter
6/ 10-12 Gerrale Street, Cronulla 2230	20/09/2011	Supporter
4/75 Mitchell Road, Cronulla	19/09/2011	Supporter
	12/09/2011	Supporter
72 Carina Road, Oyster Bay	16/09/2011	Supporter
1/21 John Davey Avenue, Cronulla	20/09/2011	Supporter
U 3/ 10-12 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	13/09/2011	Supporter
U 2/ 20 Coast Avenue, Cronulla	8/09/2011	Supporter
	20/09/2011	Supporter
Cisco Systems, Duet Apartments. Holland Road, Singapore	20/09/2011	Supporter
47 Kirkwood Road, Cronulla	19/09/2011	Supporter
1 High Street, Woollooware	20/09/2011	Supporter
	1/09/2011	Supporter

DA11/0763 – 19-21 Gerrale Street, Cronulla (2011SYE090)
Summary of Submissions Received

Contact Details	Date of Submission Letter/s	Applicant/ Objector/ Supporter
283 Young Street, Waterloo	26/09/2011	Supporter
Mojo Landscape, PO Box 942, Caringbah	7/09/2011	Supporter
1 McDonald Street, Cronulla	19/09/2011	Supporter
Pacific Conveyancing, PO Box 901, Caringbah	23/09/2011	Supporter
3 Young Street, kangaroo Point	15/09/2011	Supporter
PO Box 421, Mirand	13/09/2011	Supporter
3 Young Street, kangaroo Point	26/09/2011	Supporter
25 Meadow Place, Miranda	16/09/2011	Supporter
64 Lilli pilli Point Road, Lilli Pilli	21/09/2011	Supporter
daverezo@bigpond.com	22/09/2011	Supporter
	2/09/2011	Supporter
87 Sutherland Road, Jannali	8/09/2011	Supporter
Cronulla Travel, 82 Cronulla Street, Cronulla	21/09/2011	Supporter
14 Castlereagh Crescent, Sylvania Waters	31/08/2011	Supporter
U 6/ 3-7 Ewos Parade, Cronulla	7/09/2011	Supporter
PO Box 4725, Sylvania Waters	16/09/2011	Supporter
	4/09/2011	Supporter
joyandkev_2000@yahoo.com.au	19/09/2011	Supporter
stenzel@ozemail.com.au	9/09/2011	Supporter
13 Wallami Street, Caringbah	15/09/2011	Supporter
	30/08/2011	Supporter
martimus34@hotmail.com	16/09/2011	Supporter
L 38 / 2 Chifley Square, Sydney 2000	7/09/2011	Supporter
37 Roslyn Avenue, Brighton Le Sands	13/09/2011	Supporter
1 D Sturt Road, Cronulla	7/09/2011	Supporter
1 D Sturt Road, Cronulla	4/09/2011	Supporter

DA11/0763 – 19-21 Gerrale Street, Cronulla (2011SYE090)
Summary of Submissions Received

Contact Details	Date of Submission Letter/s	Applicant/ Objector/ Supporter
	5/09/2011	Supporter
	3/09/2011	Supporter
PO Box 945, Cronulla	26/09/2011	Supporter
27 Kenneth Avenue, Kirrawee	4/09/2011	Supporter
27 Kenneth Avenue, Kirrawee	4/09/2011	Supporter
	7/09/2011	Supporter
87 Shoalhaven Road, Sylvania Waters	14/09/2011	Supporter
37 Venetia Street, Sylvania	20/09/2011	Supporter
79 Bunarla Road, Gymea Bay	23/09/2011	Supporter
	20/09/2011	Supporter
5/18 Ozone Street, Cronulla	12/09/2011	Supporter
		Supporter
12 Wilson Place, Bonnet Bay	16/09/2011	Supporter
12 Wilson Place, Bonnet Bay	15/09/2011	Supporter
U 3A/ 14-16 Burraneer Bay Road, Cronulla	6/09/2011	Supporter
134 Nicholson Parade, Cronulla	14/09/2011	Supporter
45/ 1-9 Warburton Street, Gymea	11/09/2011	Supporter
23 Derribong Crescent, Bangor	15/09/2011	Supporter
45/1-9 Warburton Street, Gymea	10/09/2011	Supporter
4/18-20 Coast Avenue, Cronulla	5/09/2011	Supporter
2 Godwin Street, Bexley	14/09/2011	Supporter
2/75 Mitchell Road, Cronulla	21/09/2001	Supporter
15 Queanbeyan Avenue, Miranda	2/09/2011	Supporter
Bang on Cronulla, Shop 5/ 17 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	23/09/2011	Supporter
23 Bottle Forest Road, Heathcote	7/09/2011	Supporter
266 Woollooware Road, Cronulla	20/09/2011	Supporter

DA11/0763 – 19-21 Gerrale Street, Cronulla (2011SYE090)
Summary of Submissions Received

Contact Details	Date of Submission Letter/s	Applicant/ Objector/ Supporter
PO Box 2764, Taren Point	15/09/2011	Supporter
10 Kurramatta Place, Cronulla	13/09/2011	Supporter
24 Atchison Street, Flinders	17/09/2011	Supporter
	5/09/2011	Supporter
25 Woodward Avenue, Caringbah	13/09/2011	Supporter
15/7-9 Tonkin Street, Cronulla	22/09/2011	Supporter
	2/09/2011	Supporter
4/67 Denman Avenue, Woolooware	14/09/2011	Supporter
105 Bath Road, Kirrawee	1/09/2011	Supporter
8 Aldgate Street, Sutherland	9/09/2011	Supporter
24 Illawong Avenue, Caringbah	18/09/2011	Supporter
52 Brushwood Drive, Alford's Point	6/09/2011	Supporter
9 Philip Street, Cronulla	13/09/2011	Supporter
	4/09/2011	Supporter
232 Ellesmere Road, Gympie Bay	16/09/2011	Supporter
PO Box 1157, Cronulla	31/08/2011	Supporter
ron@cronullafurniture.com.au	23/09/2011	Supporter
Char Bella Boutique, Shop 4/ 17 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	23/09/2011	Supporter
5/10-12 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	25/8/11 31/08/2011	Supporter
kimcoulter@bigpond.com.au	5/09/2011	Supporter
michaelcrippss@inet.net.au	8/09/2011	Supporter
7 Clydesdale Close, Murrumbateman	15/09/2011	Supporter
De Frenza Hair Salon, 3/30 Kingsway, Cronulla	23/09/2011	Supporter
	5/09/2011	Supporter
15 Matthew Flinders Place, Burraneer	22/09/2011	Supporter
55 Taloombi Street, Cronulla	6/09/2011	Supporter

DA11/0763 – 19-21 Gerrale Street, Cronulla (2011SYE090)
Summary of Submissions Received

Contact Details	Date of Submission Letter/s	Applicant/ Objector/ Supporter
124 Bellingara Rd, Miranda NSW 2228	29/09/2011	Supporter
Beach & Bay Realty Pty Ltd, Suite 1/ 64 Croydon Street, Cronulla	13/09/2011	Supporter
Beach & Bay Realty Pty Ltd, Suite 1/ 64 Croydon Street, Cronulla	20/09/2011	Supporter
Feros Group of Hotels, 105 Parraweena Road, Taren Point	26/09/2011	Supporter
7 Via Mare, Cronulla	7/09/2011	Supporter
105 Parraweena Road, Taren Point	26/09/2011	Supporter
	18/09/2011	Supporter
63 Taloombi Street, Cronulla	30/08/2011	Supporter
63 Taloombi Street, Cronulla	31/08/2011	Supporter
dgatt@tpg.com.au	17/09/2011	Supporter
Geelan, PO Box CP 449, Condell Park 2200	8/09/2011	Supporter
32 Buchanan Svenue, Bonnet Bay	14/09/2011	Supporter
giardini, U 47/ 65-75 Captain Cook Drive, Caringbah	6/09/2011	Supporter
48 Beauford avenue, Caringbah South	7/09/2011	Supporter
In Bud Florist, 17 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	23/09/2011	Supporter
U 704/ 7-11 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	5/09/2011	Supporter
U 704/ 7-11 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	25/08/2011	Supporter
79-81 Nicholson Parade, Cronulla	29/08/2011	Supporter
55 Australia Road, Barden Ridge	8/09/2011	Supporter
232 Ellesmere Road, GyMEA Bay	16/09/2011	Supporter
1/1 Glandore Street, Woolooware 2230	26/09/2011	Supporter
Maxim Louvres, PO Box 2951, Taren Point	9/09/2011	Supporter
43 Caronia Avenue, Cronulla	8/09/2011	Supporter
182 Nicholson Parade, Cronulla	7/09/2011	Supporter
37 Venetia Street, Sylvania	15/09/2011	Supporter
Gibson Howlin Lawyers, PO Box 61, Cronulla	19/09/2011	Supporter

DA11/0763 – 19-21 Gerrale Street, Cronulla (2011SYE090)
Summary of Submissions Received

Contact Details	Date of Submission Letter/s	Applicant/ Objector/ Supporter
Indossa Hairdresser Saloon, 2/14 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	23/09/2011	Supporter
Indossa Hairdresser Saloon, 2/14 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	23/09/2011	Supporter
105 Parraweena Road, Taren Point	2/09/2011	Supporter
17 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	7/09/2011	Supporter
Ham Café, 17 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	23/09/2011	Supporter
Ham Café, 17 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	23/09/2011	Supporter
3/14 Gerrale Street, Cronulla 2230	23/09/2011	Supporter
Frangipani Ice Creams, 117 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	23/09/2011	Supporter
2/21-25 Wyanbah Road, Cronulla	31/08/2011	Supporter
6/117 Kingsway, Caringbah	21/09/2011	Supporter
6/ 10-12 Gerrale Street, Cronulla 2230	20/09/2011	Supporter
4/75 Mitchell Road, Cronulla	19/09/2011	Supporter
	12/09/2011	Supporter
72 Carina Road, Oyster Bay	16/09/2011	Supporter
1/21 John Davey Avenue, Cronulla	20/09/2011	Supporter
U 3/ 10-12 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	13/09/2011	Supporter
U 2/ 20 Coast Avenue, Cronulla	8/09/2011	Supporter
	20/09/2011	Supporter
Cisco Systems, Duet Apartments. Holland Road, Singapore	20/09/2011	Supporter
47 Kirkwood Road, Cronulla	19/09/2011	Supporter
1 High Street, Woollooware	20/09/2011	Supporter
	1/09/2011	Supporter
283 Young Street, Waterloo	26/09/2011	Supporter
Mojo Landscape, PO Box 942, Caringbah	7/09/2011	Supporter
1 McDonald Street, Cronulla	19/09/2011	Supporter
Pacific Conveyancing, PO Box 901, Caringbah	23/09/2011	Supporter

DA11/0763 – 19-21 Gerrale Street, Cronulla (2011SYE090)
Summary of Submissions Received

Contact Details	Date of Submission Letter/s	Applicant/ Objector/ Supporter
3 Young Street, kangaroo Point	15/09/2011	Supporter
PO Box 421, Mirand	13/09/2011	Supporter
3 Young Street, kangaroo Point	26/09/2011	Supporter
25 Meadow Place, Miranda	16/09/2011	Supporter
64 Lilli pilli Point Road, Lilli Pilli	21/09/2011	Supporter
daverezo@bigpond.com	22/09/2011	Supporter
	2/09/2011	Supporter
87 Sutherland Road, Jannali	8/09/2011	Supporter
Cronulla Travel, 82 Cronulla Street, Cronulla	21/09/2011	Supporter
14 Castlereagh Crescent, Sylvania Waters	31/08/2011	Supporter
U 6/ 3-7 Ewos Parade, Cronulla	7/09/2011	Supporter
PO Box 4725, Sylvania Waters	16/09/2011	Supporter
	4/09/2011	Supporter
joyandkev_2000@yahoo.com.au	19/09/2011	Supporter
stenzel@ozemail.com.au	9/09/2011	Supporter
13 Wallami Street, Caringbah	15/09/2011	Supporter
	26/09/2011	Objector
1101/ 20 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	26/09/2011	Objector
	26/09/2011	Objector
	26/09/2011	Objector
	26/09/2011	Objector
	26/09/2011	Objector
	26/09/2011	Objector
1301/ 20 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	26/09/2011	Objector
1301/ 20 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	26/09/2011	Objector

DA11/0763 – 19-21 Gerrale Street, Cronulla (2011SYE090)
Summary of Submissions Received

Contact Details	Date of Submission Letter/s	Applicant/ Objector/ Supporter
	26/09/2011	Objector
U 5/ 10 Ocean Grove Avenue, Cronulla	26/09/2011	Objector
506/ 20 Gerrale street, Cronulla	26/09/2011	Objector
	26/09/2011	Objector
306/ 20 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	26/09/2011	Objector
	26/09/2011	Objector
30 Castlewood Avenue, Woollooware	26/09/2011	Objector
106 Parthenia Street, Dolans Bay	26/09/2011	Objector
	26/09/2011	Objector
	26/09/2011	Objector
13/ 1 Ocean Grove Avenue, Cronulla	26/09/2011	Objector
	26/09/2011	Objector
	26/09/2011	Objector
24/ 31-33 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	26/09/2011	Objector
	26/09/2011	Objector
1/ 38 Parramatta Street, Cronulla	26/09/2011	Objector
801/ 20 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	26/09/2011	Objector
801/ 20 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	26/09/2011	Objector
25/ 31 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	26/09/2011	Objector
	26/09/2011	Objector
1/ 1 Ocean Grove Avenue, Cronulla	26/09/2011	Objector
804/ 20 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	26/09/2011	Objector
606/ 20 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	26/09/2011	Objector
PO Box 304, Cronulla	26/09/2011	Objector
	26/09/2011	Objector
	26/09/2011	Objector

DA11/0763 – 19-21 Gerrale Street, Cronulla (2011SYE090)
Summary of Submissions Received

Contact Details	Date of Submission Letter/s	Applicant/ Objector/ Supporter
	26/09/2011	Objector
905/ 20 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	27/09/2011	Objector
	26/09/2011	Objector
	26/09/2011	Objector
1201/ 20 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	28/09/2011	Objector
18 Ingrid Road, Sylvan Headland	26/09/2011	Objector
	26/09/2011	Objector
8/ 23 Ewos Parade, Cronulla	26/09/2011	Objector
	26/09/2011	Objector
39/ 31-33 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	26/09/2011	Objector
	26/09/2011	Objector
23C/ 1-3 McDonald Street, Cronulla	26/09/2011	Objector
204/ 20 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	27/09/2011	Objector
4 Alkaringa Road, GyMEA Bay	26/09/2011	Objector
38/ 31-33 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	26/09/2011	Objector
	26/09/2011	Objector
	26/09/2011	Objector
102/ 20 Gerrale street, Cronulla	27/09/2011	Objector
1203/ 20 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	27/09/2011	Objector
1105/ 20 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	26/09/2011	Objector
4 Alkaringa Road, GyMEA Bay	26/09/2011	Objector
1201/ 20 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	23/09/2011	Objector
201/ 20 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	26/09/2011	Objector
201/ 20 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	26/09/2011	Objector
32/ 31-33 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	26/09/2011	Objector
U 17/ 1 Surf Road, Cronulla	12/09/2011	Objector

DA11/0763 – 19-21 Gerrale Street, Cronulla (2011SYE090)
Summary of Submissions Received

Contact Details	Date of Submission Letter/s	Applicant/ Objector/ Supporter
P 6/ 1 Ocean Grove Avenue, Cronulla	26/09/2011	Objector
26/ 31-33 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	26/09/2011	Objector
704/ 20 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	26/09/2011	Objector
	26/09/2011	Objector
24/ 1 Ocean Grove Avenue, Cronulla	26/09/2011	Objector
35/ 31-33 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	26/09/2011	Objector
15 / 31-33 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	26/09/2011	Objector
4/ 14 gerrale Street, Cronulla	26/09/2011	Objector
	26/09/2011	Objector
	26/09/2011	Objector
703/ 20 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	26/09/2011	Objector
14/ 31-33 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	26/09/2011	Objector
701/ 20 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	26/09/2011	Objector
	26/09/2011	Objector
706/ 20 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	23/09/2011	Objector
	26/09/2011	Objector
	26/09/2011	Objector
402/ 20 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	26/09/2011	Objector
402/ 20 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	26/09/2011	Objector
304/ 20 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	26/09/2011	Objector
1302/ 20 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	27/09/2011	Objector
702/ 20 Gerrale Street, Cronulla	26/09/2011	Objector
21/ 1 Ocean Grove Avenue, Cronulla	26/09/2011	Objector
	26/09/2011	Objector

DA11/0763 – 19-21 Gerrale Street, Cronulla (2011SYE090)

Summary of Submissions Received

NOTE:

For the panel's interest below is a snapshot of the public submissions received from the Planning Proposal's exhibition. Some of the arguments displayed overlap with ones received from the public exhibition of the Development Application.

Summary of Public Submissions for the Planning Proposal

Prior to public exhibition, ten (10) submissions were received in opposition to the planning proposal. In total, 131 individuals and two (2) Precinct Residents Associations made submissions or signed petitions objecting to the Planning Proposal, DCP amendment and/or the DA. Most respondents who made submissions prior to exhibition also made submissions during exhibition.

Prior to public exhibition, two (2) submissions were received in support of the Planning Proposal. In total, 120 individuals made submissions or signed petitions supporting the Planning Proposal, DCP amendment and/or the DA.

Table 3: Objectors Issues

Objectors PP/DCP/DA Issue	Number of times cited
1. Objection to impact on traffic and parking	22
2. Objection to reduced solar access for neighbours	19
3. Objection to undesirable character change to area created by additional height and density	17
4. Objection due to issue of equity: Increased FSR will benefit developer at the expense of residents and with no additional public benefit. Developer bought site with development standards of 6 storeys and FSR 2:1.	13
5. Objection as increasing FSR and height will set precedent for other developers	11
6. Objection to reduced privacy for neighbours	9
7. Objection to view loss	8
8. Objection as proposed building too close to existing building- does not meet separation distance standards of Residential Flat Design Code.	7
9. Objection due to increased noise for existing residents	7
10. Objection to detrimental effect on existing garden and trees at 31-33 Gerrale Street	6
11. Objection due to loss of property value for existing residents	6
12. Objection to impact of reflectivity glare and visual impact of proposed roof form	6
13. Objection as current development standards reached with professional and community input to plan and residents purchased with these standards	5
14. Objection to changing solar access standards in DCP. Should not be compromised as they are important for residential amenity	2
15. Objection to risk to children in playground of additional traffic in Surf Lane	2

DA11/0763 – 19-21 Gerrale Street, Cronulla (2011SYE090)

Summary of Submissions Received

16. Objection to increased wind in Gerrale Street	1
17. Objection as balconies enclosed with louvres which will add to bulk of building	1
18. Objection as development has insufficient landscaping	1
Total number of individuals who made submissions or signed petitions objecting to the Planning Proposal, DCP amendment and/or the DA: 131 + 2 Residents Associations	

Table 4: Supporters Issues

Supporters PP/DCP/DA Issue	Number of times cited
1. Support as development will replace existing buildings at 19-21 Gerrale Street which are old, derelict and unattractive	48
2. Support as mixed use development will promote economic growth of Cronulla (eg with new residents and retail premises)	47
3. Support as development will improve street appearance and revitalise street and suburb in need of upgrade	46
4. Support as developer does good work eg Drift Apartments	42
5. Support as development will provide additional flats in a central location close to beach, transport, shops and services	32
6. Support as development will provide good quality prestige flats (eg for downsizers) and there is a shortage of these in Cronulla	27
7. Support as development is well designed	26
8. Support as street has other 9 storey buildings so another one is not out of character	10
9. Support as design of building fits surrounds	7
10. Support as ample on- site parking will relieve parking pressure on street.	6
11. Support as adequate solar access is provided to 31-33 Gerrale Street eg by inclined roof shape	5
12. Support as this could be the only chance to redevelop these sites	5
13. Support as approved DA for 19 Gerrale Street is less well designed building and if built will leave 21 Gerrale Street isolated. Consolidation of lots is desirable in this location.	5
14. Support as design has minimised impact on neighbouring properties	1
15. Support as increased FSR is necessary to make development financially viable	1
16. Support as developer wants to care for the landscape and complement it	1
Total number of individuals who made submissions or signed petitions supporting the Planning Proposal, DCP amendment and/or the DA: 120	

There were a total of 16 Neighbour Notifications.

Architectural Review Advisory Panel

Proposal:

Demolition of Existing Buildings and Construction of a New Mixed Use Development Comprising of Retail and Residential Units

Property:

19-21 Gerrale Street CRONULLA NSW 2230

Applicant:

Sammut Developments

File Number:

DA11/0763

The following is the report of the Architectural Review Advisory Panel Meeting held on 1 September 2011 at the Administration Centre, Sutherland Shire Council, Eton Street, Sutherland. The report documents the Panel's consideration of the proposed development described above.

“3. Consideration of Development Application No. 11/0763 – Residential Flat Building at 19-21 Gerrale Street, Cronulla

Council's Luke Murtas, Andrew Conacher and Chris Greig outlined the proposal for the Panel, including providing details of Council's relevant codes and policies and the Planning Proposal.

Frank Stanisic, Allen Sammut and Tony Polvere addressed the Panel regarding the aims of the proposal and the constraints of the site.

Description of the Site and Proposal

The subject site consists of two lots, both with dual frontage to Gerrale Street and Surf Lane. 19 Gerrale Street has a lot area of 855 sq m and 21 Gerrale Street has a lot area of 855 sq m. The site is located within Zone 8 – Urban Centre under SSLEP2006 and the proposed mixed use is permissible.

The proposal is for a residential flat building with 27 units and 595 sq m retail use. It is nine (9) storeys above ground plus three (3) basement levels. The residential component comprises seven (7) x 2 bedroom units, nineteen (19) x 3 bedroom units and one (1) x 4 bedroom unit.

There is a planning proposal currently on exhibition to amend SSLEP2006 to allow for an increase in height for 19-21 Gerrale Street from six (6) storeys to nine (9) storeys and an increase in floor space ratio from 2:1 to 3:1. The Architectural Review Advisory Panel is concurrently reviewing the planning proposal. This report assumes that the proposed development standards apply.

The access corridor to the units on each level (the 'breezeway') has not been included by the applicant in the calculation of the gross floor area of the proposal. Council officers highlighted that this position may not be accepted, which would trigger the need for a SEPP No. 1 variation.

It was explained that there is an existing approval for a six (6) storey mixed use development at 19 Gerrale Street (DA07/1430 approved in October 2008). Under SSDCP 2006 the site is required to be amalgamated with 17 & 21 Gerrale Street and 2 & 4 Ocean Grove Avenue. The amalgamation pattern was broken for DA07/1430 because of difficulties in securing amalgamation.

Widening of Surf Lane is required as part of development on this land. The proposal makes allowances for the required dedication.

Architect's Presentation

Frank Stanisic, architect, outlined the main aims and features of the proposed development and took the Panel through an urban design analysis that he had prepared to inform the design. He stated that he is very supportive of SEPP 65 principles and uses these as a starting point for a design.

The architect explained that the proposed nine (9) storey height of the building is appropriate in this street where there are taller buildings. The proposed development complies with the minimum setback requirements of SSDCP2006. It was argued by the architect that the Residential Flat Design Code does not have required separation distances between new developments and existing buildings on adjacent sites.

All units have been designed to receive three (3) hours solar access. On the southern side of the proposed development, which is four (4) metres from the boundary, bedroom windows are provided with fixed louvre blinds. Overshadowing of the existing building at 31-33 Gerrale Street is limited by chamfering the roof of the building to the angle of the solar access plane.

A series of mechanisms have been incorporated to adjust the thermal environment in the building. It is essentially a glass box with a skin of adjustable metal blinds that are controlled by occupants in response to light and weather conditions. The metal blinds are retractable behind a fascia in front of the floor slab edge. Wind conditions will also activate the blinds to retreat. During the course of the day the appearance of the building will vary depending on the position of each panel of blinds and as such it will not be a static building.

Context

Gerrale Street has a medium rise scale characterised by tower forms on podiums, with these podiums providing reasonably large spaces between buildings. A height of nine (9) storeys is considered to be consistent with this context.

The urban context allows some leeway for a 'hard' solution in terms of landscape setting. However, the proposed development does not sufficiently respect the northerly aspect of the adjoining development to the south. To the south, the neighbouring site of 31-33 Gerrale Street is occupied by a nine (9) storey residential flat building with balconies on the northern side facing the subject site. 31-33 Gerrale Street also has a landscaped strip with advanced trees on the boundary with the subject site.

The podium is not evidently related to the surrounds. More detail is required to be definitive about this.

Scale

While the height is considered to be acceptable in this locality, the bulk of the building is considered to be excessive. It is noted that other existing buildings with a floor space ratio considerably over the current control of 2:1 are casting their shadows over the street or a park. This site is a more sensitive location between two other sites meaning that the potential impact of development is greater, particularly on the building to the south. Essentially the building is too close to both the site to the south and to the northern boundary.

Built Form

In its current form this proposal relies on variance from the principles and widely used guidelines in the Residential Flat Design Code with regard to setbacks and amenity, both within and outside the site on its northern and southern boundaries. With only a four (4) metre setback to the northern boundary, it appears that the proposal would sterilise or severely limit the potential of the site to the north (17 Gerrale Street).

Increased setbacks on the north and south would improve building separation and produce a more slender built form.

Density

In the context of this site the proposal is considered to be excessively dense. Impacts on adjoining sites attest to this. While a higher density adds to the urbanity of the place, there are concerns about building separation, overshadowing and impacts on vegetation. The enclosed 'loggias' contribute to the overall bulk and are practically spaces that should be included in the floor space ratio.

After considering the need to reduce the bulk of the building and to achieve acceptable separation distances from adjacent and future developments, a maximum floor space ratio for this site of 2.5:1 is anticipated.

Resource, Energy and Water Efficiency

The external blinds, while having good qualities in moderating the internal environment, may not work in windy conditions typical in this location. Maintenance to overcome the consequences of salty conditions will be essential.

Solar panels are a positive feature. Water management is yet to be verified.

Landscape

It was concluded that the landscape design is weak. There is no statement of landscape design intent, no site analysis and no respect for existing trees to the south of the site. Some details on the landscape plan do not accord with the development application submission. The scheme shows little landscape amenity.

The rear frontage to Surf Lane is adjacent to existing landscaping on the northern side of 31-33 Gerrale Street. This includes advanced trees that are very important in their contribution to public and private amenity. It is recommended that any development of 19-21 Gerrale Street should include protection of existing trees and their root zone. Enhancement of the landscaping at the boundary with additional tree planting on the subject site would also be desirable. This would necessitate at least a 2m setback to the

southern boundary for deep soil landscaping and could incorporate larger pockets of deep soil only. The minimum requirement is that the basement should be set back 2m from the southern boundary to protect the root zone of adjacent trees. A report from an arborist or similarly qualified person is necessary to show how the long term viability of the trees can be assured.

A landscaping strip along the northern boundary is not necessary but a feature tree in the north-western corner adjacent to Surf Lane would be beneficial.

Amenity

While acknowledging the reasons for the decision, the Panel concluded that the entrance to the building is not clear and would be better located with more direct access to the lift lobby. One of the strong elements of the design is the central breezeway that divides the two sections of the building. This element would be enhanced by a central entrance and the effects of late night noise on residents of the building to the south would be reduced.

There is generally a high standard of amenity within the proposed units, although the southern units, especially the south-eastern units, do not enjoy good solar access. Even for such a highly urban proposal there is little landscape amenity.

The breezeway (with louvres fixed open) may be excessively breezy for a lot of the time. In winter it could be a cold and unpleasant space if there is no capacity to regulate the flow of air through the breezeway.

Safety and Security

From Gerrale Street the entry sequence is convoluted and not readily identified. It generates aesthetic and safety concerns.

Social Dimensions

There is no common space but the breezeway may allow some social engagement. As a minor issue it is noted that a small common area would be useful to residents for Body Corporate meetings and opportunities to get together.

Aesthetics

The potential elegance and architectural merit of this building is acknowledged. Aesthetically there is a lot to admire as demonstrated in the images presented to the Panel.

The distinctive chamfered roof form divided opinion among the Panel members and this is largely a matter of personal opinion. Some members considered it to be an interesting and distinctive feature. Others thought it unattractive and out of place in this context, especially as viewed from adjacent developments where residents will look directly at the roof. If the interests of existing residents were respected, a stepped and landscaped change in height would be preferred.

There was some concern within the Panel with respect to the dominant orientation of the building's massing to the north which, whilst the site to the north remains low scale is visually effective, over the long term may be less successful than a massing oriented to the street.

General Comments

The lack of adequate setbacks to the north and south is the major concern. In its present form the development has significant adverse consequences for existing residents to the south. A reduction in floor space would allow better separation between buildings. Rather than the redundant development control plan, the rules of thumb taken from the Residential Flat Design Code with regards to setbacks should be used to determine the footprint and therefore the floor space potential.

The lack of any deep soil planting and the potential impact of the development on the trees to the south of the site are also significant issues.

Recommendation/Conclusion:

The architectural merit of the development is acknowledged, particularly the use of split volumes, thin slabs, transparency, texture and colour. Undoubtedly a nine (9) storey building can 'fit' in this context but the bulk of the building is considered excessive. On this site a more slender building would be preferred.

In its current form the building relies on significant variance from the principles and rules of thumb in the Residential Flat Design Code with regard to building separation, setbacks and amenity, both within and outside the site on its northern and southern boundaries. These variations are not reasonable or justified and cannot be supported.

Prior to proceeding further the development should be amended as follows:

- Ensure compliance with the recommended building separation distances in the Residential Flat Design Code for the building above the podium level.
- This will require the side setback to the northern boundary of the subject site to be sufficient so as to not sterilise or severely limit future development on 17 Gerrale Street.
- Ensure the trees on the adjacent property to the south are retained by providing a setback to the basement wall of the proposed development, to protect the root zone of the adjacent trees and to introduce planting that will enhance the existing landscaping.
- The addition of some deep soil landscaped areas in the proposed development, with the north-western corner being preferred.
- Rationalise the entrance from Gerrale Street."

Colleen Baker
ARAP Coordinator

20 September 2011

Architectural Review Advisory Panel

Proposal:

Demolition of Existing Buildings and Construction of a New Mixed Use Development Comprising of Retail and Residential Units

Property:

21 Gerrale Street CRONULLA NSW 2230

1/21 Gerrale Street CRONULLA NSW 2230

2/21 Gerrale Street CRONULLA NSW 2230

3/21 Gerrale Street CRONULLA NSW 2230

4/21 Gerrale Street CRONULLA NSW 2230

5/21 Gerrale Street CRONULLA NSW 2230

6/21 Gerrale Street CRONULLA NSW 2230

7/21 Gerrale Street CRONULLA NSW 2230

8/21 Gerrale Street CRONULLA NSW 2230

9/21 Gerrale Street CRONULLA NSW 19 Gerrale Street CRONULLA NSW 2230

Applicant:

Sammut Developments

File Number:

DA11/0763

The following is the report of the Architectural Review Advisory Panel Meeting held on *Wednesday, 5 October 2011* at the Administration Centre, Sutherland Shire Council, Eton Street, Sutherland. The report documents the Panel's consideration of the proposed development described above.

"Re-Consideration of Development Application No. 11/0763 – Residential Flat Building at 19-21 Gerrale Street, Cronulla

Tony Polvere, Frank Stanisic, Allen Sammut and Brandon Wallis addressed the Panel regarding their written submission in response to the previous ARAP report.

Background

Previously the Panel considered this development application at its meeting of 1 September 2011. Following that meeting the applicant requested the opportunity to make a further presentation to respond to the issues raised in the Panel's initial report. A written response from the project architect was distributed to the Panel members prior to the meeting to allow time for all issues to be properly evaluated by the Panel members.

Previously the Panel reported to Council with its opinion about the Planning Proposal. This report is for the Joint Regional Planning Panel and is based on the assumption that the floor space ratio is increased to 3:1.

To enable a thorough evaluation of the project, the Panel again inspected the development site. As well as examining plans and aerial photographs, the Panel evaluated the context of the building and viewed surrounding developments.

During the two hour discussion, some issues were raised that are beyond the brief of the Panel. For those matters the Panel assured the project team that it would not provide an opinion. So, for example, the Panel accepted that the Joint Regional Planning Panel has expressed an opinion about how the floor space ratio should be calculated that is different to the position of the applicant but it is not the role of this Panel to comment on such matters.

A framework for discussing the most significant issues was provided by the applicant's architect through the responses that he made to the earlier report. These issues generally related to:

- Building bulk.
- Application of the Residential Flat Design Code.
- Building separation and setbacks.
- Protection of existing trees and increased planting along the boundary.
- Provision of deep soil landscaped area.
- Pedestrian entrance from Gerrale Street.

Panel's Deliberations

Having carefully considered the material presented by the Project team the Panel concluded that it was not necessary to amend its initial report from the meeting of 1 September 2011. Essentially, the Panel did not support the position argued by the applicant and the applicant's team was not moved to produce any amendments or make any concessions. These discussions concentrated on site planning and did not relate to internal design.

While the Panel is not prepared to support the current proposal, it sought to establish some principles that reflect its opinion about the development of the site. In reaching its conclusions the Panel accepted:

- that in itself the building is a well developed piece of design. The architectural merit is acknowledged. So the Panel is mindful of the intrinsic qualities of the architecture and the design intent.
- the strong arguments presented by the owner with regard to the financial viability of the project and urban planning merits of the proposed site amalgamation. Although no evidence is available to support the owner's position, the Panel accepted his submission that a 50% increase in development potential is necessary to make the proposal sufficiently attractive from a financial perspective.

Conclusions

Following the dialogue with the applicant's team, several very clear conclusions emerged for the Panel:

1. The arguments presented by the applicant in relation to building separation are not accepted. Applying the Residential Flat Design Code to this site in Cronulla, the Panel concluded that adequate building separation is currently not provided.
2. A development on this site should achieve a minimum setback of six (6) metres to the northern and southern boundaries above podium level.

3. Except for a narrow portion on the Gerrale Street frontage to permit a continuity of retail frontage, there should be no podium between the main part of the building and the north boundary of the site.
4. The podium level should be no higher than currently proposed.
5. Retaining the main pedestrian entrance adjacent to the southern boundary is acceptable. Advantage should be taken of the opportunity to integrate the design of the entrances on the adjoining sites so that both benefit from a common design intent.
6. A redesign of the building would provide the opportunity to improve the solar performance of the building, both internally and in relation to the building to the south.
7. It is evident that large trees on sites such as this contribute to reducing the apparent bulk of a building.
8. The Ground Penetrating Radar investigation of tree roots at 21 Gerrale Street was only able to penetrate to 1m depth. As indicated on the DA drawings for 31-33 Gerrale St, the large trees on the northern boundary of this site are in deep soil. Accordingly, in the Panel's opinion, the GPR findings did not negate the inclusion of at least a 2m wide area of deep soil along the south-western boundary of 21 Gerrale St.

Translating these general conclusions into further specific decisions, the Panel agrees that:

9. The southern wall of the building below and above natural ground level should be set back a minimum of two (2) metres from the boundary for its entire length. This section of deep soil is considered necessary to enable the retention and survival of the vegetation on the adjacent site and to provide an opportunity for planting appropriate species on the development site.
10. The Gerrale Street frontage should contribute to an active street edge.
11. The rain water tank should be relocated from its current position to provide an area for deep soil planting in the north-western corner of the site. Significant trees should be planted in this location.
12. A new landscape plan should be submitted illustrating the species and placement of trees to be established between the proposed building and the north boundary of its site. Selected trees need to achieve a similar scale to those currently in the space adjacent to the building to the south. The tree-planting on the south boundary should not compete with the existing trees and species selection should be suitable to withstand any anticipated wind-tunnelling.

In accepting the financial imperatives presented by the owner, the Panel considered which elements of the adopted building envelope are most critical to be observed. It was agreed that the minimum six (6) metre setbacks to the northern and southern boundaries are more critical than other elements. To address the potential impacts that the conditions outlined above may have on the financial viability of the project, the Panel also recommends that:

- The four (4) metre setback to the future Surf Lane boundary is least critical and can be relaxed. Units in the south-western corner of the building could extend closer to Surf Lane than is currently proposed without overshadowing the building to the south. This would assist the applicant in addressing planning issues

resulting from the increased setback to the south and would also serve to provide benefit to those units from improved solar access.

- The overall height of the building could be increased to ten (10) storeys to accommodate a space no greater than the net area currently proposed for Level 8. The plane of the roof should project to the north so that the form of the roof is similar to the current proposal. Compared to the current proposal, there should thus be no greater overshadowing of the building to the south.

Recommendation:

1. That the applicant be provided with a copy of this report so that the applicant has the opportunity to consider its contents.
2. That should the current proposal proceed to the Joint Regional Planning Panel, the Panel be informed that the Architectural Review Advisory Panel does not support those aspects of the proposal, as outlined in its reports and itemised above.
3. That the JRPP be provided with copies of both this report and the Panel's report from the meeting of 1 September, 2011."

Colleen Baker
ARAP Coordinator

11 October 2011